

Liberating language research from dogmas of the 20th century

Ramon Ferrer-i-Cancho^{1,*} & Carlos Gómez-Rodríguez²

¹ Complexity & Qualitative Linguistics Lab, LARCA Research Group, Departament de Ciències de la Computació, Universitat Politècnica de Catalunya, Campus Nord, Edifici Omega. Jordi Girona Salgado 1-3. 08034 Barcelona, Catalonia, Spain

² LyS Research Group, Departamento de Computación, Facultad de Informática, Universidade da Coruña, Campus de A Coruña, 15071 A Coruña, Spain

* To whom correspondence should be addressed. E-mail: rferrericancho@cs.upc.edu.

Abstract

A commentary on the article “Large-scale evidence of dependency length minimization in 37 languages” by Futrell, Mahowald & Gibson (PNAS 2015 112 (33) 10336-10341).

Central to the inspiring contributions of E. Gibson and collaborators to language research is the idea that a wide range of phenomena, e.g., ambiguity resolution, parsing difficulties or even our notion of sentence “grammaticality”, could be manifestations of a principle of dependency length minimization (e.g., references to Gibson’s work in [1]), in stark contrast to the view of generative linguistics at least.

In a recent study of impressive breadth, Futrell, Mahowald and Gibson have provided evidence of dependency length minimization across languages by means of various baselines [1]. Paradoxically, the random baselines incorporate constraints on word order that are likely to be consequences of the principle of dependency length minimization. Futrell et al. argue that their “Free Word Order Baseline” does not obey any particular word order rule, however, it is not actually free because crossing dependencies are not allowed. A truly free word order baseline, and indeed a fully null hypothesis, is one where the $n!$ possible linearizations of the n units (words) of a sentence are allowed *a priori*, as in the pioneering research on dependency length minimization by Ferrer-i-Cancho that Futrell et al. cite [1]. Furthermore, a large body of theoretical and empirical research strongly suggests that non-crossing dependencies arise as a side-effect of pressure to reduce dependency lengths (see [2] and references therein).

Therefore, investigating dependency length minimization with random baselines or an “optimal baseline” where crossings are not allowed is not only theoretically superficial, but also unnecessarily complicated and most worryingly, indicates subordination to the division between competence and performance, a dogma of generative linguistics that Gibson and collaborators have challenged in the past. Futrell et al.’s “Consistent Head Direction Baseline” is another example of baseline that is likely to incorporate dependency length minimization in its very definition: consistent head direction might be a consequence of dependency length minimization [3, 4]. Similar arguments can be made for the “Fixed word order baseline” [3].

Surprisingly, Futrell et al. take for granted dogmas behind principles and parameters theory, where the consistent branching is assumed (not explained) and its direction is determined by a parameter. In contrast, tendencies for consistent branching and its direction are less parameter-consuming predictions of a mathematical theory of dependency length minimization [3, 4].

In sum, Futrell et al.’s research on dependency length minimization is an example of radical empirical research that attempts to remain theoretically agnostic but, paradoxically, turns out to gullibly accept tenets of theoretical linguistics of the past century. Those tenets can be summarized as a belief in the existence of word order constraints that cannot be explained by evolutionary processes or requirements of performance or learning, and instead require either (a) heavy assumptions that compromise the parsimony of linguistic theory as a whole or (b) explanations based on internal constraints of obscure nature.

References

- [1] R. Futrell, K. Mahowald, and E. Gibson. Large-scale evidence of dependency length minimization in 37 languages. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 112(33):10336–10341, 2015.
- [2] R. Ferrer-i-Cancho and C. Gómez-Rodríguez. Crossings as a side effect of dependency lengths. <http://arxiv.org/abs/1508.06451>, 2015.
- [3] R. Ferrer-i-Cancho. The placement of the head that minimizes online memory. a complex systems approach. *Language Dynamics and Change*, 5:141–164, 2015.
- [4] R. Ferrer-i-Cancho. Reply to the commentary “Be careful when assuming the obvious”, by P. Alday. *Language Dynamics and Change*, 5:147–155, 2015.

Acknowledgments

R.F.C is funded by the grants 2014SGR 890 (MACDA) from AGAUR (Generalitat de Catalunya) and the grant TIN2014-57226-P from MINECO (Ministerio

de Economía y Competitividad). C.G.R is partially funded by the MINECO grant FFI2014-51978-C2-2-R and Xunta de Galicia grant R2014/034.